

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)

(2007) KLR VOL 1 PART 227 pp. 1 - 158

JANUARY 2007

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

1. Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p. 1
2. Garuba v. Yahaya p. 27
3. Ibikunle v. State p. 55
4. Udosen v. State p. 91
5. Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Service Commission p. 133

JUSTICES OF THE SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

HON. JUSTICE SALIHU MODIBBO ALFA BELGORE - CHIEF
JUSTICE OF NIGERIA (RETIRED ON 17-1-2007)
HON. JUSTICE IDRIS LEGBO KUTIGI
HON. JUSTICE SYLVESTER UMARU ONU
HON. JUSTICE ALOYSIUS IYORGYER KATSINA-ALU
HON. JUSTICE UMARU ATU KALGO
HON. JUSTICE NIKI TOBI
HON. JUSTICE DAHIRU MUSDAPHER
HON. JUSTICE GEORGE ADESOLA OGUNTADE
HON. JUSTICE SUNDAY AKINOLA AKINTAN
HON. JUSTICE ALOMA MARIAM MUKHTAR
HON. JUSTICE MAHMUD MOHAMMED
HON. JUSTICE WALTER SAMUEL NKANU ONNOGHEN
HON. JUSTICE IKECHI FRANCIS OGBUAGU
HON. JUSTICE FRANCIS FEDODE TABAI
HON. JUSTICE IBRAHIM TANKO MOHAMMAD
HON. JUSTICE PIUS OLAYIWOLA ADEREMI
HON. JUSTICE CHRISTOPHER M. CHUKWUMA-ENEH

JUSTICES OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

THE HON. JUSTICE UMARU ABDULLAHI
- PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

ABUJA DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE RABIU DANLAMI MUHAMMAD
THE HON. JUSTICE OLUFUNLOLA OYELOLA ADEKEYE
THE HON. JUSTICE MARY PETER ODILI
THE HON. JUSTICE OYEBISI FOLAYEMI OMOLEYE
THE HON. JUSTICE ABDU ABOKI
THE HON. JUSTICE CHIDIEBERE NWOMA UWA

BENIN DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE SAKAADEYEMI IBIYEYE
THE HON. JUSTICE STANLEY SHENKO ALAGOA
THE HON. JUSTICE UWANIM. ABBA AJI
THE HON. JUSTICE GEORGE OLADEINDE SHOREMI
THE HON. JUSTICE ALIA. B. GUMEL

CALABAR DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE VICTOR AIME POMO O. OMAGE
THE HON. JUSTICE NWALE SYLVESTER NGWUTA
THE HON. JUSTICE JEAN OMOKRI
THE HON. JUSTICE GERTRUDE IFUNANYA UDOM-AZOGU
THE HON. JUSTICE MOJEED A. OWOADE

ENUGU DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE JAMES OGENYI OGEBE
THE HON. JUSTICE RAPHAEL OLUFEMI ROWLAND
THE HON. JUSTICE JAFARU MIKA'ILU
THE HON. JUSTICE SOTONYE DENTON-WEST
THE HON. JUSTICE JIMI OLUKAYODE BADA

IBADAN DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE JOHN AFOLABI FABIYI
THE HON. JUSTICE M. DATTIJO MUHAMMAD
THE HON. JUSTICE AMINAA. AUGIE
THE HON. JUSTICE ALFRED P. E. AWALA
THE HON. JUSTICE JOHN INYANG OKORO

ILORIN DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE MUHAMMAD S. MUNTAKA-COOMASSIE
THE HON. JUSTICE TIJANI ABDULLAHI
THE HON. JUSTICE HELEN MORONKEJI OGUNWUMIJU
THE HON. JUSTICE JUMMAI HANNATU SANKEY
THE HON. JUSTICE IGNATIUS IGWE AGUBE

JOS DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE ZAINAB ADAMU BULKACHUWA
THE HON. JUSTICE KUMAI BAYANG AKA AHS
THE HON. JUSTICE MOHAMMED LADAN-TSAMIYA
THE HON. JUSTICE AHMAD O. BELGORE
THE HON. JUSTICE UZO I. NDUKWE-ANYANWU

KADUNA DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE BABA AALKALI BA'ABA
THE HON. JUSTICE AMIRU SANUSI
THE HON. JUSTICE ABUBAKAR ABDULKADIR JEGA
THE HON. JUSTICE KUDIRAT M. O. KEKERE-EKUN
THE HON. JUSTICE OLUKAYODE ARIWOOLA

LAGOS DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE ISAAYO SALAMI
THE HON. JUSTICE DALHATU ADAMU
THE HON. JUSTICE CLARA BATA OGUNBIYI
THE HON. JUSTICE MONICA DONGBAN-MENSEM
THE HON. JUSTICE RAPHAEL CHIKWE AGBO
THE HON. JUSTICE PAULA. GALINJE
THE HON. JUSTICE ADZIRA GANA MSHELIA
THE HON. JUSTICE HUSSEIN MUKHTAR

PORTHARCOURT DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE SULEIMAN GALADIMA
THE HON. JUSTICE ISTIFANUS THOMAS
THE HON. JUSTICE M. L. GARBA
THE HON. JUSTICE BODE RHODES-VIVOUR
THE HON. JUSTICE IBRAHIM MOH'D MUSA SAULAWA

ACTIONS - Jurisdiction - Cause of action - Judicial precedents - Detinue
- As cause of action against 2nd respondent - Occurred in Anambra State
- It is that State that will determine the case - And Fadayomi case is not
relevant here (H1) Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p.
1

APPEALS - Briefs - Arguments - Canvassed on appeal - Contrary to
findings of fact not appealed against - Have no basis in law - And cannot
be countenanced - By appellate court (H4) Ibikunle v. State p. 55

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Exceptional circumstances - Where not
shown by appellant - The findings will not be disturbed (H8) Ziideeh v.
Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm. p. 133

APPEALS - Interference - Findings of fact - Should not be ordinarily
disturbed by appellate court - Save there be misdirection - That occasioned
miscarriage of justice (H1) Garuba v. Yahaya p. 27

APPEALS - Issues - Newness of - Pleadings - Where issues were joined
between the parties - On a subject vide their pleadings - Preliminary
objection that the issue is new - Will be overruled (H1) Ziideeh v. Rivers
State Civil Serv. Comm. p. 133

APPEALS - Pleadings - Civil Service Rules - As both parties pleaded facts
- Related thereto - Court of Appeal was wrong - In holding that plaintiff
never pleaded it (H6) Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm. p. 133

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Fair hearing - Fundamental nature of -
Guaranteed under s. 33(1) 1979 Constitution - It cannot be waived nor be
taken away by a statute - And it entails observance - Of the twin pillars of
the rules of natural justice (H2) Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm.
p. 133

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Jurisdiction - High Court's unlimited jurisdiction - Vide s. 236(1) 1979 Constitution - Does not invalidate s. 239 - As to each State's High Court Rules - Governing its exercise of jurisdiction (H3) Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p. 1

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Jurisdiction - Rules of Court - Where a State High Court has jurisdiction - High Court Law of another State shall not apply - Vide s. 239 1979 Constitution (H2) Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p. 1

CRIMINAL LAW - Defences - S.33 (2)(b), 1999 Constitution - The provisions of that section - Is not a licence to the appellant - To summarily execute deceased - Extrajudicially as he did (H2) Ibikunle v. State p. 55

CRIMINAL LAW - Murder - Constitutional defence - Under s.33(2)(b), 1999 Constitution - The defence avails only those whose presence at scene of murder - Is in furtherance of lawful arrest - In circumstances permitted by law (H5) Ibikunle v. State p. 55

CRIMINAL LAW - Murder - Intention to kill - This should be inferred - From the circumstances - Where probability of death is high - In view of the intentional act of injury committed - By the accused (H7) Ibikunle v. State p. 55

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Arrest - Use of force to effect arrest - S.7(1) and (2), CPL - The provisions of the section - Do not permit appellant - To execute any person - Who refuses him ingress - Into a place a suspect has entered (H3) Ibikunle v. State p. 55

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Murder - Burden of proof - Rests with the prosecution - To prove guilt of the accused beyond reasonable doubt - Resulting doubt in the present case - Is resolved in appellant's favour - Unto discharging and acquitting him (H5) Udosen v. State p. 91

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2007) 1 KLR vii

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Police powers - Reasonable use of force - Deceased having been surrounded with no means of escape - Appellant acted unreasonably - When he fired into the room - Occupied by both the deceased - And other family members (H6) *Ibikunle v. State* p. 55

CUSTOMARY LAW - Appeals - Native courts' proceedings - Visit to locus - Attitude of appellate court thereto - Is consideration of the substance - Not the form (H2) *Garuba v. Yahaya* p. 27

EVIDENCE - Murder - Witnesses - Reliability - Two conflicting versions of prosecution's evidence - Matters that make PW7 seem unreliable (H4) *Udosen v. State* p. 91

LAND LAW - Title - Appeals - Appraisal of evidence - Where trial Area Court - Failed to properly consider evidence led by the defence - Interference by appellate courts - Was justified (H3) *Garuba v. Yahaya* p. 27

MASTER & SERVANT - Judicial precedents - Civil Service Rules - *Iderima* case - That dealt with dismissal - Is not on all fours with present case - That is based on termination (H7) *Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm.* p. 133

MASTER & SERVANT - Termination - Fair hearing - Where appellant's appointment was terminated - Vide a letter giving him notice - Fair hearing is not denied - Though Board of Inquiry's recommendation - Was not followed (H4) *Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm.* p. 133

MASTER & SERVANT - Wrongful termination - Proof - Fair hearing - Where an employee complains - That he was wrongfully terminated - Onus of proof rests on him - And appellant failed to discharge that burden (H5) *Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm.* p. 133

MURDER - Evidence - Contradiction - Lower courts did not properly

viii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2007) 1 KLR

consider - The inconsistencies in prosecution's two versions of evidence (H1) Udosen v. State p. 91

MURDER - Intent - Transferred malice doctrine - As it was not shown that appellant - Intended to cause death or grievous harm to anybody - Prosecution failed to show the requisite intent under s.319 CC (H3) Udosen v. State p. 91

MURDER - Witnesses - Hostile witness - Where two versions of evidence are so mutually contradictory - That they could not both be true - What prosecution and the court should do (H2) Udosen v. State p. 91

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Issues - Raised for determination - But not argued upon - Effect - Where an issue though raised for determination - Is not argued upon by the party raising it - It is deemed abandoned (H1) Ibikunle v. State p. 55

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Submissions of counsel - Contrary to evidence - Submissions of counsel - Cannot be substituted - For evidence - They should be based on evidence - Or be discountenanced (H8) Ibikunle v. State p. 55

TRIBUNALS - Fair hearing - Respondent being a domestic tribunal - Is bound to observe rules of natural justice - And breach of s. 33(1) 1979 Constitution - Will make decision reached a nullity (H3) Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm. p. 133

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

- Constitution of Nigeria 1979 s. 36(6)(e)(a) & (e) Udosen v. State p. 91
- Constitution of Nigeria 1979, ss. 239, 236(1) & (2), 6(2), 231 Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p. 1
- Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1979 s. 33(1) Ziideeh v. Rivers State Civil Serv. Comm. p. 133
- Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999, s.33 (2)(b) Ibikunle v. State p. 55
- Criminal Code of Eastern Nigeria 1963, ss. 319, 32(1) - (4) Udosen v. State p. 91
- Criminal Code, Cap.48, Laws of Bendel State, s.316(1) and (2) Ibikunle v. State p. 55
- Criminal Procedure Law of Delta State, s.7(1) and (2) Ibikunle v. State p. 55
- High Court Law Cap. 60 Laws of Lagos State 1994, ss. 11(i) (a), 13, 14 Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p. 1
- High Court Law Cap. 61 Laws of Eastern Nigeria s. 22(2) Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p. 1
- Lagos State High Court (Civil Procedure) Rules 1972 O. 1A r. 3 Capital Bancorp Ltd v. Shelter Savings & Loans Ltd p. 1
- Police Act s. 24 Ibikunle v. State p. 55